



PHILIP E. KARMEL

Partner New York

E: <u>philip.karmel@bclplaw.com</u>

T: <u>+1 212 541 2311</u>

BIOGRAPHY

Philip Karmel has broad experience serving as litigation and regulatory counsel in environmental, land use, real estate and toxic tort matters. His experience includes matters arising under environmental review statutes (NEPA and SEQRA); Clean Air Act permitting, compliance and litigation; Superfund and oil spill litigation and counseling; pesticide-related personal injury and property damage litigation; zoning and other land use matters; government investigations; brownfields redevelopment; eminent domain litigation; and the environmental aspects of corporate and real estate transactions.

Major projects for which he has served as counsel include the Penn Station Area Project; the Belmont Project in Nassau County; NYU Core 2031; the Atlantic Yards development in Brooklyn; the Second Avenue subway; Riverside Center (a 5-building mixed-use development in Manhattan); the reconstruction of LaGuardia Airport; new terminals at John F. Kennedy International Airport; the East

River Repowering Project; Moynihan Train Hall; Columbia University's Manhattanville campus; electric utility substations in New York City and Westchester; capital improvements at City College, the Fashion Institute of Technology and Brooklyn College; and the IKEA store in Brooklyn.

He has tried many cases in federal and state courts and before administrative law judges and arbitrators. His pre-trial and post-trial litigation experience includes taking or defending more than 150 depositions and briefing or arguing motions or appeals in California, Colorado, Hawaii, Maryland, Montana, New York, Pennsylvania, Texas, Virginia, Washington, D.C., West Virginia and Wisconsin.

REPRESENTATIVE REPORTED DECISIONS:

- Penn Community Defend Fund v. New York State Urban Development Corp., Index No. 159154/2022; AAG Management, Inc. v. New York State Urban Development Corp., Index No. 159184/2022, 2023 WL 6126233 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. County Sept. 19, 2023)
- Neighbors Opposing Noise, Inc. v. MTA, Index No. 57115/2023 (Sup. Ct. Westchester County Aug. 7, 2023)
- Purchase Meeting Religious Society of Friends v. Westchester Joint Water Works, Index No. 56719/2023 (Sup. Ct. Westchester County June 27, 2023)
- Tronox Inc. v. Kerr-McGee Corp., 2021 WL 623998 (Bankr. S.D.N.Y. Feb. 17, 2021)
- Peyton v. BSA, 36 N.Y.3d 271 (2020)
- Carnegie Hill Neighbors, Inc. v City of New York, 188 A.D.3d 560 (1stDep't 2020), affirming 2019
 NY Slip Op 31182(U) (Sup. Ct. N.Y. County April 24, 2019)
- Barrett v. A&P Pacific Owner, LLC, 179 A.D.3d 883 (2d Dep't 2020)
- Village of South Blooming Grove v. Village of Kiryas Joel Board of Trustees, 175 A.D.3d 1413
 (2d Dep't 2019)
- Indian River County v. Department of Transportation, 348 F. Supp. 3d 17 (D.D.C. 2018), aff'd, 945 F. 3d 515 (D.C. Cir. 2019)
- Sierra Club v. Martens, 53 Misc.3d 1204(A), 2016 WL 5719815 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. 2016), aff'd, 156 A.D. 3d 454 (1st Dep't 2017)
- Indian River County v. Rogoff, 110 F. Supp. 3d 59 (D.D.C. 2015), subsequent opinion, 201 F.
 Supp. 3d 1 (D.D.C. 2016), subsequent opinion, 254 F. Supp. 3d 15 (D.D.C. 2017)
- Glick v. Harvey, 25 N.Y.3d 1175 (2015)

- HLP Properties, LLC v. Consolidated Edison Company of New York, Inc., 2014 WL 6604741 (S.D.N.Y. 2014), subsequent opinion, 2015 WL 5092627 (S.D.N.Y. 2015)
- Yorkshire Towers Co. v. U.S. Depart. of Transp., 2011 WL 6003959 (S.D.N.Y. 2011)
- 233 East 69th Street Owners Corp. v. LaHood, 797 F. Supp. 2d 326 (S.D.N.Y. 2011)
- Peter Williams Enterprises Inc. v. N.Y.S. Urban Dev. Corp., N.Y.L.J. Sept. 30, 2010, 2010 WL 3703264 (Sup. Ct. Kings County 2010)
- Kaur v. N.Y.S. Urb. Dev. Corp., 15 N.Y.3d 235 (2010)
- Develop Don't Destroy (Brooklyn), Inc. v. Empire State Dev. Corp., 26 Misc.3d 1236(A), 2010 WL 936220, subsequent opinion, 30 Misc.3d 616, subsequent opinion, 33 Misc.3d 330 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. County 2011), aff'd 94 A.D.3d 508 (1st Dep't 2012)
- In the Matter of N.Y.S. Urb. Dev. Corp., 2010 WL 702319 (Sup. Ct. Kings County 2010)
- Goldstein v. N.Y.S. Urban Dev. Corp., 13 N.Y.3d 511 (2009)
- Consolidated Edison Co. of New York, Inc. v. Fyn Paint & Lacquer Co., Inc., 334 Fed. Appx. 390, 2009 WL 1674411 (2nd Cir. 2009)
- Develop Don't Destroy (Brooklyn), Inc. v. Empire State Dev. Corp., 59 A.D.3d. 312 (1st Dep't 2009), leave to appeal denied, 13 N.Y.3d 713 (2009), reargument denied, 14 N.Y.3d 748 (2010)
- Anderson v. N.Y.S. Urb. Dev. Corp., 45 A.D.3d 583 (2nd Dep't 2007)
- Red Hook/Gowanus Chamber of Commerce v. N.Y.C. Bd. of Standards and Appeals, 5 N.Y.3d
 452 (2005)
- Herald Square South Civic Ass'n v. Consolidated Edison Co. of New York, Inc., 4/17/03,
 N.Y.L.J., p. 20, col. 6 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. Co. 2003)
- Dole Food Co. v. Patrickson, 538 U.S. 468 (2003)
- 27th Street Block Ass'n v. Dormitory Authority of State of New York, 302 A.D.2d 155 (1st Dep't 2002)
- Long Island Pine Barrens Society, Inc. v. Supervisor of Town of East Hampton, 293 A.D.2d 616
 (2nd Dep't 2002)
- Long Island Pine Barrens Society, Inc. v. Town of Islip, 286 A.D.2d 683 (2nd Dep't 2001)

- In the Matter of Consolidated Edison Co. of New York, Inc., 2001 WL 1572918 (N.Y.S. Bd. Elec. Gen. Siting & Env. 2001)
- In the Matter of Consolidated Edison Co. of New York, Inc., 2001 WL 470661 (N.Y. Dept. Env. Conserv. 2001)
- Coalition to Preserve the Westside Artists Dist. v. Chaverim Kol Yisrael/Jewish Life Network,
 1998 WL 35421131 (Sup. Ct. N.Y. County Jan. 28, 1998)
- Town of Oyster Bay v. Occidental Chemical Corp., 987 F. Supp. 182 (E.D.N.Y. 1997)
- Merson v. McNally, 90 N.Y.2d 742 (1997)
- United States v. Broderick Investment Co., 862 F. Supp. 272 (D. Colo. 1994)
- In re Cuyahoga Equipment Corp., 980 F.2d 110 (2nd Cir. 1992)

AREAS OF FOCUS

Renewables & Storage

CIVIC INVOLVEMENT & HONORS

- U.S. Department of Justice, Washington, D.C. Trial Attorney, Environmental Enforcement Section: 1989-94
- U.S. Department of Justice Special Achievement Award for Sustained Superior Performance of Duty
- U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Bronze Medal for Commendable Service
- Law Clerk to the Hon. Edward R. Becker, U.S. Circuit Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit: 1988-89
- New York League of Conservation Voters, State Board Member, 2019-Present
- New York County Lawyers' Association Boris Kostelanetz President's Medal conferred in recognition of an "extraordinary record of dedication" to the Association and "distinguished service to the legal profession": Dec. 17, 2013
- MFY Legal Services, Inc. Scale of Justice Award for Pro Bono Work: 2005

- Village of Hastings-on-Hudson Local Waterfront Revitalization Plan Steering Committee: 1997-2010 (Chair, 2002-2010)
- University of Chicago Law Review Comments Editor: 1987-88
- Greenburgh Hebrew Center Trustee (2006-2018); Vice President (2006-2010; 2011-2013);
 Executive Vice President (2013-2015); President (2015-2017); Honorary Trustee (2018-Present)
- The Best Lawyers in America: 2013-Present
- Chambers USA: America's Leading Lawyers for Business: 2005-Present
- Who's Who Legal: Environment: 2012-Present
- Super Lawyers: 2006-Present

PROFESSIONAL AFFILIATIONS

- American Bar Association Editor (2009-2012) and Region 2 Reporter (2000-2018) of SEER's
 Air Quality Committee Newsletter
- Association of the Bar of the City of New York Committee on Environmental Law, 1998-2001
- New York State Bar Association
- Environmental Law Institute

ADMISSIONS

- New York, 1989
- United States Supreme Court
 United States Courts of Appeals for the Second, Third, Ninth and District of Columbia Circuits
 United States District Courts for the Eastern, Northern, Southern and Western Districts of New York, and the District of Columbia

EDUCATION

University of Chicago, J.D., cum laude, 1988

University of Cambridge, M.Phil., 1985

University of Pennsylvania, B.A., with Honors in Economics, 1984

RELATED CAPABILITIES

- Energy Transition
- Planning & Zoning
- Electric Vehicles & Charging Infrastructure
- Renewables & Storage
- Environment
- Real Estate Disputes
- Environmental and Toxic Tort
- Insurance & Reinsurance
- Investigations
- Commercial Real Estate
- Health & Safety
- Regulation, Compliance & Advisory
- ESG & Energy Transition
- Sustainable Real Estate
- Real Estate
- Litigation & Dispute Resolution
- Higher Education
- Financial Services
- Catastrophic Accidents
- Consumer Fraud
- Consumer Products
- Food, Ag & Nutrition
- Insurance (Class Actions)
- Pharmaceutical & Medical Devices (Class Actions)
- Pharmaceutical & Medical Devices (Mass Torts)
- Class Actions
- Infrastructure
- Eminent Domain
- Employment & Labor
- Cross-border Employment Issues
- Business & Commercial Disputes
- Mass Torts & Product Liability

RESOURCES

PUBLICATIONS

- "Open Space Accessibility and the Conundrum Of High Stakes Zoning Disputes," New York Real Estate Law Reporter, Vol. 37, No. 3, February 2021 (with James P. Colgate and Judith M. Gallent)
- "Environmental and Toxic Tort Litigation," a chapter in Commercial Litigation in New York
 State Courts (West Publishing 5th Ed. 2020)
- "Now Is The Time To Engage With NY Climate Reg Process," Law 360, Sept. 14, 2020 (with J. Kevin Healy)
- "Scallops vs. Wind Energy: Consideration of Alternative Sites for Off-Shore Wind Farms," New York Law Journal, May 1, 2017 (with J. Kevin Healy)
- "The Proposed Wind Farm Off The Shore Of Long Island," Environmental Law In New York, vol. 27, no. 9, pp. 143-151, Sept. 2016 (with J. Kevin Healy and Charla Beth Mobley)
- "Interstate Transport and Regional Approaches to Regulating Air Pollution," a chapter in *The Clean Air Handbook* (American Bar Association 4th Ed. 2016)
- "Environmental and Toxic Tort Litigation," a chapter in *Commercial Litigation in New York*State Courts (West Publishing 4th Ed. 2015)
- "Interstate Transport and Regional Implementation Plans," a chapter in The Clean Air Handbook (American Bar Association 3d Ed. 2011)
- "Environmental and Toxic Tort Litigation," a chapter in *Commercial Litigation in New York*State Courts (West Publishing 3d Ed. 2010 and annual supplements)
- "Environmental and Toxic Tort Litigation," a chapter in *Commercial Litigation in New York*State Courts (West Publishing 2d Ed. 2005 and annual supplements)*
- "The State Environmental Quality Review Act," a chapter in *Environmental Law and Regulation* in New York (West Publishing 1996 & annual supplements) (with J. Kevin Healy)*
- "Air Report on USEPA Region II," for the quarterly newsletter published by the Air Quality Committee of the ABA's Section of Environment, Energy and Resources, 2000-2016
- "Exploring New Rules for Natural Resource Damage Assessments," New York Law Journal, March 24, 2009
- "Property Damages, 'Bright Line Accrual Rule,' Multiple Injuries," *New York Law Journal*, January 7, 2009
- "Public Nuisance as a Product Liability Tort," New York Law Journal, December 1, 2008

- "Mitigation of Environmental Impacts under SEQRA," Environmental Law in New York, vol. 19, no. 2, pp. 21-26, February 2008 (with L. Margaret Barry)
- "Vapor Intrusion: Indoor Pollution and Human Exposure," New York Law Journal, July 10, 2008
- "The Threshold Limit Values Controversy," New York Law Journal, Jan. 3, 2008
- "The New European Chemicals Law," New York Law Journal, Aug. 6, 2007
- "Punitive Damages and Harm to Nonparties," New York Law Journal, March 27, 2007
- "Fluid Recovery in Class Action Litigation," New York Law Journal, Dec. 26, 2006*
- "Public Nuisance Claims in Product Liability Cases," New York Law Journal, Sept. 28, 2006*
- "Litigating No-Threshold Cancer Effects," New York Law Journal, Aug. 22, 2006*
- "Fryeing the Defendant in Cancer-Cluster Litigation," New York Law Journal, June 29, 2006*
- "Public Official Liability for Catastrophic Events," New York Law Journal, March 23, 2006*
- "Disclosure on Trial: 'Substantial Risk' Reporting Requirements," New York Law Journal, Dec. 30, 2005*
- "Cleaning Up New York Brownfields and Other Contaminated Sites After 'Cooper Industries v. Aviall," Environmental Law in New York, vol. 17, no. 1, pp. 1-8, Jan. 2006 (with Laurence Horvath)
- "Court's Deferred Docket Order for Asbestos Claims," New York Law Journal, Sept. 27, 2005*
- "Consumer Protection Law Claims in Toxic Torts Litigation," New York Law Journal, (Aug. 23, 2005)*
- "Preemption After 'Bates v. Dow Agrosciences," New York Law Journal, June 28, 2005*
- "Director and Officer Liability for Toxic Torts," New York Law Journal, March 22, 2005*
- "Pre-Packaged Asbestos Bankruptcy Up in Smoke in Third Circuit?" New York Law Journal,
 Dec. 28, 2004*
- "Toxicogenomics: A New Tool for Plaintiffs and Defendants," New York Law Journal, Sept. 28, 2004*
- "Toxicogenomics: A New Science Emerges," New York Law Journal, Aug. 31, 2004*
- "Making a Federal Case Out of Toxic Torts," New York Law Journal, June 22, 2004*

- "Fraud on the Fetus: A New Cause of Action Emerges," New York Law Journal, March 23, 2004*
- "Trespass as a Toxic Tort," New York Law Journal, Dec. 23, 2003*
- "The Agent Orange Case and Finality of Judgments in Class Actions," New York Law Journal,
 September 10, 2003*
- "Asbestos Litigation: Is a Legislative Solution Finally in the Offing?" New York Law Journal,
 June 24, 2003*
- "Differential Diagnosis and Proof of Toxic Injury," New York Law Journal, March 31, 2003*
- "New Techniques to Assess Risk," New York Law Journal, Dec. 18, 2000
- "Achieving Radical Reductions in Cleanup Costs, New Solutions to Environmental Problems in Business & Real Estate Deals," PLI 2000, 2001, 2002, 2003 and 2004
- "PM2.5: Federal and New York Regulation of Fine Particulate Air Pollution," Environmental Law in New York, vol. 13, no. 7, pp. 115-24, July 2002
- "PM2.5: Federal and California Regulation of Fine Particulate Air Pollution," *California Environmental Law Reporter*, vol. 2002, no. 8, pp. 226-37, Aug. 2002 (with Thomas N. Fitzgibbon)
- "Lead Paint Liability Is on the Rise: Owners and Others Should Review Their Management Practices," *New York Law Journal*, June 17, 2002
- Principal author "Comments on the Final Report of the Governor's Superfund Working Group," Association of the Bar of the City of New York, 1999
- Principal author "Letter to ABA Regarding Proposed Brownfields Resolution," Association of the Bar of the City of New York, 1999
- "Tax Assessment of Contaminated Properties," Real Estate Weekly, Feb. 18, 1998
- "Natural Resource Damages to the Hudson River," New York Law Journal, Sept. 11, 1997
- "High Court Misses Boat on Navigation Law," 9 N.Y. Business Environment no. 3, 1996
- "Injunctions Pending Arbitration," 54 U. Chi. L. Rev. 1373, 1987
- * Book chapters and articles co-authored with Peter R. Paden

SPEAKING ENGAGEMENTS

- Co-Chair; Environmental Regulation in Practice 2024: New Challenges and Controversies, Practising Law Institute, Sept. 20, 2024; presentation, Regulatory Update: Environmental Review, Fuel and Gas Emissions, Power Plants, and Cross-State Air Pollution
- Co-Chair; Environmental Regulation in Practice 2023: New Challenges and Controversies,
 Practising Law Institute, Aug. 2, 2023; presentation, Clean Air Act Update
- Co-Chair; Environmental Regulation in Practice 2022: New Challenges and Priorities, Practising Law Institute, Sept. 16, 2022; presentation, Environmental Review
- Co-Chair; Environmental Regulation in Practice 2021: New Challenges and Priorities, Practising Law Institute, Sept. 17, 2021; presentation, Cumulative and Aggregate Risk in Environmental Regulation
- Co-Chair, Environmental Regulation in Practice 2020: Permitting, Litigating, and Deal Negotiations, Practising Law Institute, Sept. 25, 2020; presentation, The New NEPA Regulations and Trump Administration Initiatives Regarding Scientific Information and Cost-Benefit Analysis
- Co-Chair, Environmental Regulation 2019: Hot Topics, Regulatory Developments, and Practical Guidance for Corporate Compliance, Practising Law Institute, Sept. 27, 2019; presentation, Clean Air Act Update
- Environmental and Land Use Issues, PLI's 20th Annual Commercial Real Estate Institute, Dec.
 4, 2018
- How Climate Change Will Affect Non-Environmental Law Practice Real Estate and Land Use Law, New York City Bar Association, Oct. 26, 2018
- Co-Chair, "Environmental Regulation 2018: Hot Topics, Regulatory Developments, and Practical Guidance for Corporate Compliance," Practising Law Institute, June 8, 2018; presentation – "Environmental Practice in the New Administration: NEPA"
- "Environmental and Land Use Issues for the Sophisticated Real Estate Practice," PLI's 19th
 Annual Commercial Real Estate Institute, Dec. 5, 2017
- Co-Chair, "Environmental Regulation 2017: Hot Topics, Regulatory Developments, and Practical Guidance for Corporate Compliance"; Practising Law Institute, June 9, 2017; presentation – "Environmental Review Issues for the New Administration's Infrastructure Program"
- "Environmental Issues in Real Estate Deals," PLI's 18th Annual Commercial Real Estate Institute, Dec. 6, 2016

- Co-Chair, "Environmental Regulation 2016: Hot Topics, Regulatory Developments, and Practical Guidance for Corporate Compliance," Practising Law Institute, June 10, 2016; presentation
 "Permitting Issues for Wind and Solar Power Plants"
- "Wind Power: Environmental Due Diligence and Permitting Issues," Bloomberg BNA Webinar,
 April 5, 2016
- "Environmental Review and Permitting for Wind, Solar and Gas-Fired Energy Projects,"
 Infocast's Energy Project Finance Tutorial, December 9, 2015
- "Environmental Issues in Real Estate Deals," PLI's 17th Annual Commercial Real Estate Institute, Dec. 2, 2015
- Co-Chair, "Environmental Regulation 2015: Hot Topics, Regulatory Developments, and Practical Guidance for Corporate Compliance," Practising Law Institute, June 12, 2015; presentation – "Environmental Due Diligence and Negotiation of Real Estate and Corporate Deals"
- Co-Chair, "Environmental Regulation 2014: Hot Topics, Regulatory Developments, and Practical Guidance for Corporate Compliance," Practising Law Institute, Dec 5, 2014; presentation – "Contaminated Sites and Real Estate Issues"
- "Environmental Issues in Real Estate Deals," PLI's 16th Annual Commercial Real Estate Institute, Nov. 21, 2014
- Co-Chair, "Environmental Regulation 2013: Hot Topics, Regulatory Developments and Practical Guidance for Corporate Compliance," Practising Law Institute, Dec. 6, 2013; presentation –
 "Clean Air Act - Regulatory and Case Law Developments 2013"
- "Environmental Issues in Real Estate Deals," PLI's 15th Annual Commercial Real Estate Institute, Nov. 22, 2013
- "Environmental Review Process Identifying and Mitigating Environmental Risk in an Era of Increased Environmental Regulation," Infocast's Project Finance: The Tutorial, Sept. 24, 2013
- "The Impact of the D.C. Circuit's Decision in Sierra Club v. EPA on Obtaining a PSD Permit under the Clean Air Act," Practising Law Institute One-Hour Briefing, May 7, 2013
- Chair, "Catastrophe and the Law: What Lawyers Need to Know to Advise Clients to Prepare and Respond to Disasters in 2013," Practising Law Institute program, 2013; presentation – "Environmental and Land Use Law"
- "SEQRA Ramifications For Long-Term Phased Projects In Times Of Economic Uncertainty,"
 NYS Bar Association program, 2013

- Co-Chair, "Environmental Regulation 2012: Hot Topics, Commercial Implications and Management Strategies," Practising Law Institute program, 2012; presentation – "Climate Change Regulatory Developments 2012"
- "Preparing for the Article X Hearing and Litigation under New York's New Power Plant Siting Law," EUCI Webinar, 2011
- Co-Chair, "Environmental Regulation 2011: Managing in the Face of Rapid Change," Practising
 Law Institute program, 2011; presentation "Climate Change Regulatory Developments 2011"
- Chair, "The Environmental Impact Review of Energy Facilities under NEPA and Its State-Law Counterparts," Infocast Webinar, 2010; presentation – "Addressing the Risk of Accidents and Terrorism and the Alternatives Analysis"
- Co-Chair, "Environmental Regulation and Commercial Implications 2010: How the New Administration, Congress and the Courts Have Changed the Rules," Practising Law Institute program, 2010; presentation – "Climate Change Regulatory Developments 2010"
- "The Breadth and Depth of SEQRA," Lorman Seminar, 2008
- "SEQRA Mitigation Measures," Lorman program, 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012
- "Environmental Issues in the Financing of Power Projects," Infocus program, 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2011, 2012
- "Environmental Due Diligence and Environmental Insurance Issues for the Sophisticated Real Estate Practice," Practising Law Institute program, 2005, 2006, 2007, 2008, 2009, 2010
- Co-Chair, "New Solutions to Environmental Problems in Business and Real Estate Deals," an annual program sponsored by the Practising Law Institute, 2000-2004; presentation –
 "Achieving Radical Reductions in Cleanup Costs"
- "SEC Disclosure Requirements for Environmental Liabilities and the Impact of the Sarbanes-Oxley Act," NYS Bar Association program, 2003
- "Tort Litigation Arising from Groundwater Contamination," NYS Bar Association program, 2000

RELATED INSIGHTS

Insights Mar 17, 2025

EPA Announces New National Enforcement Policies

EPA Risk Evaluation for 1,4-Dioxane

Events

Sep 17, 2024

BCLP attorneys present at PLI program on challenges and controversies in environmental practice

Insights

Jul 11, 2024

Chevron Overruled

Insights

Mar 26, 2024

Climate Change Due Diligence for Real Estate Acquisitions

Awards

Aug 17, 2023

The Best Lawyers in America® 2024

Events

Jul 27, 2023

Partners present at PLI program on challenges and controversies in environmental practice

News

Jun 01, 2023

Chambers USA 2023

Blog Post

Dec 13, 2022

1.4-Dioxane Listed as an EPA Contaminant

On October 28, 2022, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") listed 1,4-dioxane on the Fifth Contaminant Candidate List ("CCL 5"). This is an important step to EPA's potential regulation of 1,4-dioxane under the Safe Drinking Water Act.Links to the EPA documents highlighting the significance of the CCL 5 designation are available here: CCL 5 Federal Register Notice; EPA's CCL 5 Website; EPA's Press Release; and EPA's Response to Comments for CCL 5.